## State of California DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE



1515 CLAY STREET, 20TH FLOOR P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND, CA 94612-0550

Public: (510) 622-2100 Telephone: (510) 622-2183 Facsimile: (510) 622-2270

E-Mail: Harrison.Pollak@doj.ca.gov

November 13, 2009

Sears Holding Company c/o Michael J. Steel Morrison & Foerster LLP 425 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94105

RE: Lead in Children's Product Purchased at Sears (PHT 230)

Dear Mr. Steel:

We just received a report about a children's product purchased in a Sears store in Richmond, California that contains illegal levels of lead. The lead levels reported exceed the limits in the federal Consumer Product Safety Improvement Act ("CPSIA"). Furthermore, selling the product without a proper warning likely violates California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, commonly known as "Proposition 65." We are writing to ask that you stop selling the product immediately and take other corrective action as needed.

The children's product is a pair of open-toed "Paula" shoes. The SKU is 742282835542. It was purchased at a Sears store at the Hilltop Mall in Richmond, California, on October 5, 2009. Our internal reference number is PHT 230. Please use it in communications with our office about this. We have enclosed photographs of the product.

The item was purchased by an investigator for the Center for Environmental Health, using a grant from a fund administered by the Public Health Institute. The fund was established through a Proposition 65 settlement between our office and several companies over lead in toys. (*People v. Mattel et al.*, Alameda County Super. Ct., Civ. No. RG 07-356892.) After screening the product for lead, the Center for Environmental Health sent a sample to a federally-approved laboratory for further testing. The test results, which are enclosed, indicate 3,957 parts per million ("ppm") lead in the orange plastic on the insole of the shoes. This exceeds federal lead limits, which deem a children's product with more than 300 ppm lead in an accessible component a "banned hazardous substance." It also appears to violate Proposition 65, which requires a clear and reasonable warning prior to exposing persons to known carcinogens and reproductive toxins, including lead. (Cal. Health & Saf. Code, § 25249.6; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 27001.)

Sears Holding Co. c/o Michael J. Steel November 13, 2009 Page 2

Lead is a toxic metal that damages the nervous system and other organs. Even at low levels of exposure, lead can impact brain development in children. Based on what appears to be violations of federal and state law, you should stop selling the product immediately. Additionally, please send us any test results you have and any representations from the manufacturer or supplier about the lead content in the product. Please contact us immediately so we can discuss what further actions your company intends to take.

Sincerely,

HARRISON M. POLLAK Deputy Attorney General

For EDMUND G. BROWN JR. Attorney General

**Enclosures** 

cc (via electronic mail): Mark Schoem, Consumer Product Safety Commission

OK2007900181 90127736.doc





9.99



ine@sears.com/shoes

Exova 2395 Speakman Dr. Mississauga Ontario Canada 1,5K 183 T: +1 (905) 822-4111 F: +1 (905) 823-1446 E: sales@exova.com W: www.exova.com

Exova

Testing. Advising. Assuming.

## Certificate of Analysis

## No.: 09-013-13564-3 Total Lead Test on Children's Product

Client: Centre for Environmental Health Address: 2201 Broadway Suite 302, Oakland, CA 94612, U.S.A	Contact: Caroline Cox Phone: 510-655-3900 Fax: 510-655-9100 Email: Caroline@ceh.org		
Date Received: November 6, 2009	Date Reported: November 11, 2009		

Date Analyzed: November 10, 2009

Client Sample ID	Description of Tested Sample Parts	Exova Sample ID	Method	Total Lead Content (ppm)
PHT230	Orange material on insole of TKS pink and orange shoe	09-13564-38631	CPSC-CH- E1002-08	3957

Analyzed by:

Reported by:

Jack Li. B.Sd.

Analyst, Trace Metals & Specialty Chemicals

Health Sciences

Peter Susel, B.Sc., C. Chem.

Mgr, Trace Metals & Specialty Chemicals

Health Sciences

This report and service are covered under Exova Canada Inc's. Standard Terms and Conditions of Contract which may be found on our company's website <a href="https://www.exova.com">www.exova.com</a>, or by calling 1-866-263-9268.